

IHS Chemical

Process Economics Program

Report 292
Bio-Based Succinic Acid

By Susan Bell

September 2014

ihs.com/chemical



IHS Chemical agrees to assign professionally qualified personnel to the preparation of the Process Economics Program's reports and will perform the work in conformance with generally accepted professional standards. No other warranties expressed or implied are made. Because the reports are of an advisory nature, neither IHS Chemical nor its employees will assume any liability for the special or consequential damages arising from the Client's use of the results contained in the reports. The Client agrees to indemnify, defend, and hold IHS Chemical, its officers, and employees harmless from any liability to any third party resulting directly or indirectly from the Client's use of the reports or other deliverables produced by IHS Chemical pursuant to this agreement.

For detailed marketing data and information, the reader is referred to one of the IHS Chemical programs specializing in marketing research. THE IHS CHEMICAL ECONOMICS HANDBOOK Program covers most major chemicals and chemical products produced throughout the world. In addition the IHS DIRECTORY OF CHEMICAL PRODUCERS services provide detailed lists of chemical producers by company, product, and plant for the United States, Europe, East Asia, China, India, South & Central America, the Middle East & Africa, Canada, and Mexico.

PEP Report 292

Bio-Based Succinic Acid

By Susan Bell

September 2014

Abstract

Succinic acid is a linear C₄ molecule with carboxylic acid groups on each terminal carbon atom. It has tremendous potential as a platform chemical for a number of industrial chemicals. It is currently used as an intermediate in the production of polyesters, alkyd resins, polyurethanes, plasticizers, 1,4-butanediol and solvents. The conventional process to produce succinic acid uses a petroleum-derived feedstock, which is both costly and environmentally unfriendly. In North America, the growing availability of inexpensive natural gas from shale has led to a shortage of C₄ chemicals as ethylene steam cracker operators have moved from crude-based feeds to natural gas-based ethane. Thus, there has been higher volatility in pricing and availability of C₄ petroleum-based feedstock and the value chains that depend on them, including succinic acid. Consequently, there has been a great deal of interest in producing C₄ and higher compounds such as succinic acid from renewable resources not only for the environmental benefits, but also to escape the economic volatility associated with petroleum-based feedstocks. A number of companies are commercializing the production of succinic acid from renewable resources via the fermentation of sugars, with the intent of making bio-based succinic acid a drop-in replacement for conventional succinic acid. Several relatively large-scale bio-based succinic acid production plants are currently being built.

In this PEP report, we present process designs and associated cost estimates for producing succinic acid using three bio-based processes, specifically processes based on patents and other publicly available literature associated with BioAmber, Myriant, and Reverdia. The designs presented in this report are for a base case capacity of 37.5 kta or 82.7 million lb/yr of succinic acid. Both Reverdia and BioAmber use genetically modified yeast to produce succinic acid, while Myriant technology is based on genetically modified bacteria. Process economics presented for these technologies include both capital costs as well as production costs, thereby enabling a direct comparison of the economics of these technologies.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	1-1
2. Summary	2-1
Introduction	2-1
Industrial aspects	2-1
Overview	2-1
Succinic acid demand growth	2-2
Renewable feedstocks	2-2
Commercial capacity succinic acid producers	2-4
Technical aspects	2-5
Conventional (petroleum-based) routes to succinic acid	2-5
Bio-based routes to succinic acid	2-5
Economic aspects	2-8
Capital cost comparison	2-9
Variable production cost comparison	2-11
Total production cost comparison	2-11
Product value comparison	2-12
3. Industry status	3-1
Current and potential markets	3-1
Bio-based succinic acid as a drop in replacement for conventional succinic acid: Biodegradable polyesters	3-2
Bio-based succinic acid as a replacement for maleic anhydride: Production of 1, 4-Butanediol	3-3
Bio-based succinic acid as a replacement for adipic acid	3-4
Bio-based succinic acid as a replacement for phthalic anhydride	3-4
Succinic acid demand growth	3-4
Business drivers for bio-based succinic acid	3-6
Commercial capacity succinic acid producers	3-6
Process developers	3-7
BioAmber	3-7
Myriant Technologies	3-8
Reverdia	3-9
Succinity GmbH	3-9
4. Succinic acid production chemistry and technology	4-1
Introduction	4-1

Properties of succinic acid.....	4-1
Commercial specifications of succinic acid	4-2
Conventional (petroleum-based) routes to succinic acid.....	4-3
Bio-based routes to succinic acid.....	4-4
Renewable feedstock	4-4
Fermentation - microorganisms	4-5
BioAmber	4-17
Myriant	4-18
Reverdia.....	4-20
Succinity	4-22
5. Economic evaluation of bio-based succinic acid production: Yeast-based technology by a process similar to BioAmber process.....	5-1
Introduction	5-1
BioAmber technology	5-1
Yeast aerobic growth rate at pH 7.....	5-3
Succinic acid production rate, process yield and selectivity	5-4
Defined media for biomass growth	5-4
Succinic acid fermentation conditions	5-5
Recovery and purification	5-6
Material of construction	5-8
Process description.....	5-8
Section 100 – Succinic acid fermentation.....	5-15
Section 200 – Recovery and purification.....	5-16
Cost estimates.....	5-17
Capital costs.....	5-17
Production costs.....	5-20
6. Economic evaluation of bio-based succinic acid production: Bacteria-based technology by a process similar to Myriant process.....	6-1
Introduction	6-1
Myriant technology	6-1
Yeast aerobic growth rate.....	6-4
Succinic acid production rate, process yield and selectivity	6-4
Defined media for biomass growth	6-5
Succinic acid fermentation conditions	6-5
Recovery and purification	6-5

Material of construction	6-7
Process description.....	6-7
Section 100 – Succinic acid fermentation.....	6-15
Section 200 – Recovery and purification.....	6-16
Cost estimates.....	6-17
Capital costs.....	6-17
Production costs.....	6-20
7. Economic evaluation of bio-based succinic acid production: Yeast-based technology by a process similar to Reverdia process	7-1
Introduction.....	7-1
Reverdia technology.....	7-1
Yeast aerobic growth rate at pH 7.....	7-3
Succinic acid production rate, process yield and selectivity	7-3
Defined media for biomass growth	7-4
Succinic acid fermentation conditions	7-5
Recovery and purification	7-5
Material of construction	7-6
Process description.....	7-6
Section 100 – Succinic acid fermentation.....	7-13
Section 200 – Recovery and purification.....	7-14
Cost estimates.....	7-15
Capital costs.....	7-15
Production costs.....	7-18
Appendix A: Patent summaries.....	A-1
Appendix B: Design and cost bases.....	B-1
Design conditions.....	B-2
Cost bases.....	B-2
Capital investment	B-2
Project construction timing.....	B-4
Available utilities.....	B-4
Production costs.....	B-4
Effect of operating level on production costs	B-5
Appendix C: Cited references.....	C-1
IHS publications	C-2
IHS CEH Reports	C-2

IHS PEP Reports and Reviews	C-2
Literature	C-2
Patents	C-12
Appendix D: Patent references by company	D-1
Appendix E: Process flow diagrams	1

Tables

Table 2.1: Estimated Potential Demand by Markets.....	2-2
Table 2.2: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Producers	2-5
Table 3.1: Estimated Potential Demand by Markets.....	3-5
Table 3.2: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Producers	3-6
Table 4.1: Succinic Acid and Maleic Anhydride Physical Properties	4-2
Table 4.2: Commercial Specifications of Succinic Acid	4-3
Table 4.3: Succinate Yields from Three Metabolic Routes	4-6
Table 4.4: Succinic Acid Production of Different Bacteria Species	4-7
Table 4.5: Succinic Acid Production of Yeast.....	4-16
Table 4.6: Succinic Acid Production Performance	4-21
Table 5.1: BioAmber's and Cargill's Fermentation Patents	5-2
Table 5.2: Succinate Yields from Metabolic Routes	5-4
Table 5.3: BioAmber's Succinic Acid Recovery and Purification Patents.....	5-6
Table 5.4: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to BioAmber Process Design Bases and Assumptions.....	5-9
Table 5.5: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to BioAmber Process Stream Flows.....	5-10
Table 5.6: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to BioAmber Process Major Equipment.....	5-13
Table 5.7: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to BioAmber Process Utilities Summary	5-15
Table 5.8: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to BioAmber Process Total Capital Investment	5-18
Table 5.9: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to BioAmber Process Capital Investment By Section.....	5-19
Table 5.10: Summary of Major Liquid Waste Streams	5-20
Table 5.11: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to BioAmber Process Production Costs	5-20
Table 6.1: Myriant's Fermentation Patents.....	6-2

Table 6.2: Myriant’s Succinic Acid Recovery and Purification Patents.....	6-6
Table 6.3: Succinic Acid Recovery (WO 2011082378 and US 20130096343).....	6-6
Table 6.4: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Bacteria Fermentation Technology Similar to Myriant Process Design Bases and Assumptions.....	6-9
Table 6.5: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Bacteria Fermentation Technology Similar to Myriant Process Stream Flows.....	6-9
Table 6.6: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Bacteria Fermentation Technology Similar to Myriant Process Major Equipment.....	6-13
Table 6.7: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Bacteria Fermentation Technology Similar to Myriant Process Utilities Summary	6-15
Table 6.8: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Bacteria Fermentation Technology Similar to Myriant Process Total Capital Investment	6-18
Table 6.9: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Bacteria Fermentation Technology Similar to Myriant Process Capital Investment By Section.....	6-19
Table 6.10: Summary of Major Liquid Waste Streams	6-20
Table 6.11: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Bacteria Fermentation Technology Similar to Myriant Process Production Costs	6-21
Table 7.1: Reverdia’s Fermentation Patents	7-2
Table 7.2: Reverdia’s Succinic Acid Recovery and Purification Patents	7-6
Table 7.3: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to Reverdia Process Design Bases and Assumptions	7-7
Table 7.4: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to Reverdia Process Stream Flows	7-9
Table 7.5: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to Reverdia Process Major Equipment.....	7-11
Table 7.6: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to Reverdia Process Utilities Summary	7-13
Table 7.7: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to Reverdia Process Total Capital Investment.....	7-16
Table 7.8: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to Reverdia Process Capital Investment By Section	7-17
Table 7.9: Summary of Major Liquid Waste Streams	7-18
Table 7.10: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by Yeast Fermentation Technology Similar to Reverdia Process Production Costs.....	7-19
Table A-1: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production Patent Summary.....	A-2

Figures

Figure 1.1: Succinic Acid Molecular Structure	1-1
---	-----

Figure 1.2: Succinic Acid Value Chain	1-1
Figure 2.1: Historical Corn Price–United States.....	2-3
Figure 2.2: Historical Glucose Price–United States.....	2-4
Figure 2.3: Simplified Flow Diagram: Bio-based Succinic Acid Production Based on Yeast Technology.....	2-6
Figure 2.4: Simplified Flow Diagram: Bio-based Succinic Acid Production Based on Myriant Technology.....	2-7
Figure 2.5: Simplified Flow Diagram: Bio-based Succinic Acid Production Based on Reverdia Technology.....	2-8
Figure 2.6: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Fixed Capital Cost Process Comparison	2-9
Figure 2.7: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Battery Limits Investment Process Comparison	2-10
Figure 2.8: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Offsites Installed Cost (Utilities and Storage) Process Comparison	2-10
Figure 2.9: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Variable Production Cost Process Comparison	2-11
Figure 2.10: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Total Production Cost Process Comparison.....	2-12
Figure 2.11: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Product Value Process Comparison	2-13
Figure 3.1: Succinic Acid Derivatives	3-1
Figure 3.2: Block Diagram of Polybutylene Succinate Production	3-3
Figure 3.3: 1,4-Butanediol Value Chain	3-3
Figure 4.1: Succinic Acid Molecular Structure	4-1
Figure 4.2: Succinic Acid Dehydration.....	4-2
Figure 4.3: Oxidation of Butane to Maleic Anhydride	4-3
Figure 4.4: Hydrogenation of Maleic Anhydride to Succinic Anhydride.....	4-3
Figure 4.5: Hydrogenation of Succinic Anhydride to gamma-Butyrolactone	4-4
Figure 4.6: Hydrolysis of Succinic Anhydride to Succinic Acid.....	4-4
Figure 4.7: Flowchart of the Production of Succinic Acid	4-5
Figure 4.8: Reductive and Oxidative Tricarboxylic Acid Cycle Arms.....	4-6
Figure 4.9: Succinic Acid Production Pathways in <i>E. coli</i>	4-8
Figure 4.10: Succinic Acid Recovery by Reactive Distillation	4-12
Figure 4.11: Succinic Acid Recovery by Reactive Extraction.....	4-13
Figure 4.12: Succinic Acid Production Pathways in <i>S. cerevisiae</i>	4-15
Figure 4.13: Succinic Acid Recovery by Adsorption	4-17
Figure 4.14: Genetically Engineered Yeast Strain With Active Reductive TCA and Pentose Phosphate Pathways	4-18
Figure 4.15: Myriant’s Succinic Acid Process.....	4-20
Figure 4.16: Reverdia’s Succinic Acid Recovery and Purification Process	4-22

Figure 5.1: Bio-based Succinic Acid Production Based on Yeast Technology Simplified Flow Diagram.....	5-1
Figure 5.2: BioAmber Pathway to Succinic Acid from Glucose (WO 2014018757).....	5-3
Figure 5.3: Solubility of Succinic Acid in Water.....	5-7
Figure 5.4: BioAmber Process to Recover and Purify Succinic Acid (WO 2013039647)	5-7
Figure 5.5: BioAmber Process to Recover and Purify Succinic Acid (WO 2013088239)	5-8
Figure 5.6: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by a Process Similar to BioAmber Process	E-2
Figure 5.7: Sensitivity of Succinic Acid Production Cost to Glucose Feedstock Cost.....	5-23
Figure 5.8: Sensitivity of Succinic Acid Product Value Including 15% Pretax ROI to Glucose Feedstock Cost	5-24
Figure 6.1: Bio-based Succinic Acid Production Based on Myriant Technology Simplified Flow Diagram.....	6-1
Figure 6.2: Genetically Modified <i>E. coli</i> Pathway to Succinic Acid from Glucose (WO 2008115958)...	6-3
Figure 6.3: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by a Process Similar to Myriant Process	E-4
Figure 6.4: Sensitivity of Succinic Acid Production Cost to Glucose Feedstock Cost.....	6-23
Figure 6.5: Sensitivity of Succinic Acid Product Value Including 15% Pretax ROI to Glucose Feedstock Cost	6-24
Figure 7.1: Simplified Flow Diagram: Bio-based Succinic Acid Production Based on Reverdia Technology.....	7-1
Figure 7.2: Reverdia Pathway to Succinic Acid from Glucose (WO 2013004670)	7-3
Figure 7.3: Bio-Based Succinic Acid Production by a Process Similar to Reverdia Process.....	E-6
Figure 7.4: Sensitivity of Succinic Acid Production Cost to Glucose Feedstock Cost.....	7-21
Figure 7.5: Sensitivity of Succinic Acid Product Value Including 15% Pretax ROI to Glucose Feedstock Cost	7-22